



Efficacy of Essential Oils Against Black Bean Aphid (*Aphis fabae* Scopoli) under Laboratory Conditions

Rabina Pandit ^{a*}, Bishnu Dawadi ^a, Amir Pandit ^a
and Gayatri Kumari Upadhaya ^b

^a Lamjung Campus, Institute of Agriculture and Animal Science, Tribhuvan University, Nepal.

^b Campus of Live Sciences, Institute of Agriculture and Animal Science, Tribhuvan University, Nepal.

Authors' contributions

This work was carried out in collaboration among all authors. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

Article Information

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.9734/ajrcs/2024/v9i4305>

Open Peer Review History:

This journal follows the Advanced Open Peer Review policy. Identity of the Reviewers, Editor(s) and additional Reviewers, peer review comments, different versions of the manuscript, comments of the editors, etc are available here: <https://www.sdiarticle5.com/review-history/124954>

Original Research Article

Received: 05/08/2024
Accepted: 11/10/2024
Published: 16/10/2024

ABSTRACT

The black bean aphid (*Aphis fabae*), poses a significant threat to cultivated crops, leading to food insecurity and hunger concerns. Essential oils from plants offer promising low-risk alternatives to synthetic chemicals for aphid control whose widespread use has raised serious environmental and health issues. To assess the efficacy of plant essential oils, an experiment was carried out at the Entomology Laboratory of Lamjung Campus, Tribhuvan University following a completely randomized design with three replications using eight treatments including a control (distilled water and ethanol). The essential oils used were Neem (*Azadirachta indica*), Eucalyptus (*Eucalyptus globulus*), Palma rosa (*Cymbopogon martinii*), Citronella (*Cymbopogon winterianus*), lemongrass (*Cymbopogon citratus*), Juniper berry (*Juniperus recurva*), Mint (*Mentha arvensis*) and control

*Corresponding author: E-mail: rabinapanditrp@gmail.com;

(distilled water and ethanol) at the concentration of 1% and 2% with the exposure time of 12, 24 and 48 hours for contact mortality and 2 μ L and 4 μ L with the exposure time of 12 and 24 hours for fumigation mortality. The result revealed that individual mortality rate increased with increasing oil concentration and exposure time. Lemongrass with 2% concentration resulted in the high mortality percentage (66.66%) whereas, Neem with 1% concentration demonstrated the lowest (23.3%) in contact assay. Similarly, in fumigation assay, the highest mortality percentage was exhibited by 4 μ L Lemongrass (100%) when compared to 2 μ L Neem and Juniper berry have lowest mortality percentage (73.33%) after the control. Therefore, Lemongrass with 2% concentration for contact assay and 4 μ L Lemongrass for fumigation assay was considerably more effective than other used essential oils. However, more research is necessary with locally available essential oils to assure the long-term effectiveness in field and lab conditions with different concentrations and exposure time. The result could benefit the farmer and gardener by developing essential oils as commercial products to apply natural, eco-friendly and non-toxic management method which is alternative to synthetic pesticides.

Keywords: Black bean aphid; essential oils; faba bean; mortality.

1. INTRODUCTION

Aphids being the most hostile pests for almost all cultivated crops, seriously diminish the productivity of crops and cause spoilage by sucking the sap from the leaves as well as delicate stems [1]. The annual average yield losses brought on by aphids range from 30 to 50% [2]. Aphid's saliva includes non-enzymic, reducing compounds, which, in the presence of oxidases, can mix with and inactivate protective phytochemicals, including those generated in response to damage and transmitted in the phloem sieve tube sap on which aphid feed [3]. The black bean aphid (*Aphis fabae*) is a major pest of field beans which are sown in the season of spring and the data of field studies have revealed that yield losses by the black bean aphid infestations can exceed 50% of the yield [4]. Black bean aphids directly damage the plants by feeding on the phloem that results in severe reductions of plant development and productivity [5]. In addition to direct plant injury, black bean aphid infestation harms faba bean due to honeydew excretion on the leaves, which interferes with physiological processes in the host plant [6]. These aphids can indirectly damage by acting as vectors for plant viruses [7] such as the bean leaf rolling virus and the faba bean necrotic yellows virus [8]. It has been long since botanical insecticides have been regarded as acceptable alternatives for killing the harmful insects because of their low retention in the environment, minimal toxicity to mammals, better selectivity and the popularity [9]. Numerous plant species' essential oils have a variety of insecticidal, anti feedant, repellent, oviposition-deterrent, growth-regulating, and anti vectorial effects on nuisance insects [10]. Essential oils

are complicated, organic, volatile compounds with a distinct smell that are produced by aromatic plants as secondary metabolites. They are often produced via steam or hydro-distillation, which Arabs invented in the Middle Ages [11]. The majority of research concluded that essential oils have significant potential for pest management, particularly in greenhouses and fields [12]. Essential oils are very bioactive and can be very effective insecticides. As a result, there should be a lot more research done on them to help manage aphids [13].

2. MATERIALS AND METHODS

The experiment was carried out from March to April of 2023 in the entomology laboratory of the Institute of Agriculture and Animal Science, Lamjung campus, which is in Sundarbazar, the Lamjung district of Gandaki province. The site was located at an elevation of 610m above sea level with latitude: 28.2847° N and longitude: 84.3637° E under humid sub-tropical climate. The highest and lowest temperatures recorded were, respectively, 28–30°C and 20–22°C. Apterous (wingless) black bean aphid was collected from the field of faba bean located nearby Lamjung campus by cutting aphid prone stem of plant with the help of sickle. The brushes were used to transfer the aphid from cut stem to petri plate. The required essential oils were obtained from Herbs Production and Processing Company Limited, Kathmandu. Two factorial Completely Randomized Experimental Design was selected as the design of the research. Seven treatments of essential oils namely: Neem, Eucalyptus, Palma rosa, Citronella, Lemongrass, Juniper berry, Mint along with one

control were used. Three replication per treatments were done. The aphid mortality was assayed through two parameters during the experiment.

2.1 Contact Mortality Assay (Leaf Dip Bioassay)

Using ethanol as a non-polar solvent, each treatment oil was dissolved before being utilized to investigate the direct contact effect of essential oils on aphid species. There were two concentration levels 1% and 2% -prepared for each treatment. In three replications, each individual faba bean leaf was immersed in the oil solution of every treatment for about five minutes. The volatile solvent was then allowed to evaporate by letting them dry for a while. Following treatment, the leaves were placed in sterile Petri plates with damp filter paper within. In each petri dish, ten aphids were released and given time to settle on the leaves that had been treated. Then the petri plate was covered by muslin cloth so that aphids present inside the petri plate could not escaped away. After 12 hours and 24 hours, the number of dead aphids was counted. Using a little brush to gently strike the aphid and keeping an eye out for any movement of its legs or antennae, one may identify dead aphids.

2.2 Fumigation Mortality Assay

Saturated filter paper was stored in three layers within sterile 9 cm petri dishes. At the bottom of the filter sheets was a tiny, rectangular (5x2 cm) filter paper. Each essential oil was directly added to the rectangular piece of filter paper with a micropipette, at concentrations of 2 μ L and 4 μ L. To avoid direct contact between the oils and the experimental pest, ten aphids were then introduced onto the upper layer of the petri dish. To keep the treated oils from leaking, parafilm was then used to enclose the entire apparatus. Similar methods were described in Chalise & Dawadi, 2019.

Mortality of aphids was counted after 12hrs, 24hrs and 48hrs. Mortality of treated aphid was then calculated by dividing the number of dead aphids in petri plate by total number of aphids in petri plate and expressing it in terms of percentage. The collected data of aphid mortality was processed with MS Excel 365 and analysis of variance was done using R- Stat software (version 4.1.0). Mean comparison was done

using Duncan's Multiple Range Test at 5% level of significance.

3. RESULTS

3.1 Effect of Treatments on the Contact Mortality of Aphid

At 12hrs, the highest mortality percentage was found in Lemongrass (26.66%) which was statistically par with Palmarosa and Mint and the lowest mortality rate was in control. The lowest aphid mortality after control was in Neem (10%) which was statistically par with Citronella and Eucalyptus. Similarly, at 24hrs, highest aphid mortality was seen in Lemongrass (43.33%) and lowest mortality was in Neem (15%) but Eucalyptus and Juniper berry were also significantly at par. In the 48hrs, similar result was observed where Lemongrass had the highest aphid mortality rate (61.66%) which was statistically similar with Palmarosa and Eucalyptus. The lowest mortality percentage was shown by Eucalyptus (30%) which was statistically par with Neem.

The mortality rate had increased with exposure time and higher the concentration of Essential oils from 1% to 2%, more was the mortality rate. From the interaction table, in 12hrs it was found that Mint at 2% concentration revealed the highest mortality percentage (33.33%) which was statistically par with Lemongrass (30%) and Palmarosa (26.66%) but Neem at 1% concentration demonstrated lowest mortality (6.66%). In 24hrs, Lemongrass with 2% concentration exhibited the highest mortality rate (53.33%) whereas lowest mortality was shown by Neem, juniper berry and citronella at 1% concentration with 13.33%. Similarly, in 48hrs, Lemongrass with 2% mortality exhibited the highest mortality (66.66%) whereas Neem with 1% mortality showed the lowest (23.33%).

3.2 Effect of Treatments on Fumigation Mortality of Aphid

From the table, at 12hrs, the highest mortality percentage was shown by Palmarosa and Mint with 85% but statistically, it was similar with Citronella, Eucalyptus and Lemongrass. Mortality percentage in Lemongrass was highest (98.33%) at 24hrs which were significantly par with Citronella, Eucalyptus and Mint. Neem at 12hrs (71.66%) and 24hrs (75%) showed the lowest mortality percentage after control.

Table 1. Effect of Essential oils on aphid mortality on contact assay

Factor A (Essential oils)	Contact mortality after treatment application		
	12hrs	24hrs	48hrs
Neem	10.00 ^c	15.00 ^d	31.66 ^{cd}
Eucalyptus	15.00 ^{bc}	18.33 ^{cd}	30.00 ^d
Palmarosa	25.00 ^a	35.00 ^b	55.00 ^a
Citronella	13.33 ^{bc}	23.33 ^c	43.33 ^b
Lemongrass	26.66 ^a	43.33 ^a	61.66 ^a
Juniper berry	16.66 ^b	18.33 ^{cd}	38.33 ^{bc}
Mint	23.33 ^a	33.33 ^b	45.00 ^b
Control	1.66 ^d	6.66 ^e	8.33 ^e
CV%	17.73	13.13	15.19
F-test	***	***	***
LSD	5.36	6.57	6.99
SEM	2.97	4.28	5.82
Factor B (Concentration)	12hrs	24hrs	48hrs
1%	12.08 ^b	18.33 ^b	32.91 ^b
2%	20.83 ^a	30.00 ^a	45.41 ^a
CV%	17.73	13.13	15.19
F-test	***	***	***
LSD	2.68	3.28	3.49
SEM	4.375	5.835	6.25
Grand mean	16.45	24.16	39.167
P value	.	**	**

, ** and *** at P=.05, P=.01 and P=.001 level of significant respectively.

Table 2. Interaction of essential oils and concentration on aphid mortality in contact assay

Essential oils	12hrs		24hrs		48hrs	
	1%	2%	1%	2%	1%	2%
Neem	6.66 ^{ghi}	13.33 ^{efg}	13.33 ^{gh}	16.66 ^{fg}	23.33 ^g	40.00 ^{de}
Eucalyptus	10.00 ^{fgh}	20.00 ^{cde}	10.00 ^{gh}	26.66 ^{de}	26.66 ^{fg}	33.33 ^{ef}
Palmarosa	23.33 ^{bcd}	26.66 ^{abc}	33.33 ^{cd}	36.66 ^{bc}	43.33 ^{cd}	66.66 ^a
Citronella	10.00 ^{fgh}	16.66 ^{def}	13.33 ^{gh}	33.33 ^{cd}	30.00 ^{fg}	56.66 ^b
Lemongrass	23.33 ^{bcd}	30.00 ^{ab}	33.33 ^{cd}	53.33 ^a	56.66 ^b	66.66 ^a
Juniper berry	10.00 ^{fgh}	23.33 ^{bcd}	13.33 ^{gh}	23.33 ^{ef}	33.33 ^{ef}	43.33 ^{cd}
Mint	13.33 ^{efg}	33.33 ^a	23.33 ^{ef}	43.33 ^b	40.00 ^{de}	50.00 ^{bc}
Control	0.00 ⁱ	3.33 ^{hi}	6.66 ^h	6.66 ^h	10.00 ^h	6.66 ^h
LSD	7.59		3.28		9.89	
Grand mean	16.45		24.16		39.16	
CV%	17.73		24.23		15.19	

The mortality rate had increased with exposure time and concentration of Essential oils from 1 µl to 2 µl. From the interaction table, in 12hrs, it was observed that Lemongrass with 4 µl concentration showed the highest mortality (93.33%) and in 24hrs, highest mortality was observed in Lemongrass with 4 µl concentration (100%) whereas lowest mortality was shown by 2 µl Neem and Juniper berry with 73.33%.

4. DISCUSSION

Tomova et al. [13], Ebrahimi et al. [9], Alghamdi [2] also reported that the action of essential oils on the aphid is dosage dependent that the individual mortality percentage increased with increasing oil concentration. Hence, lemongrass was effective against black bean aphid in both contact and fumigation assay which was in agreement with Shahid Nisar et al. [14] reported that the best results with the

Table 3. Effect of Essential oils on aphid mortality in fumigation assay

Factor A (Essential oils)	Fumigation mortality after using treatments	
	12hrs	24hrs
Neem	71.66 ^c	75.00 ^d
Eucalyptus	81.66 ^{ab}	95.00 ^{ab}
Palmarosa	85.00 ^a	90.00 ^{bc}
Citronella	83.33 ^{ab}	96.66 ^{ab}
Lemongrass	78.33 ^{abc}	98.33 ^a
Juniper berry	76.66 ^{bc}	83.33 ^c
Mint	85.00 ^a	95.00 ^{ab}
Control	5.00 ^d	6.66 ^e
CV%	8.39	7.21
F-test	***	***
LSD	6.99	6.78
SEM	9.54	10.83
Factor B (concentration)	12hrs	24hrs
2µl	66.25 ^b	77.08 ^b
4 µl	75.41 ^a	82.91 ^a
CV%	8.39	7.21
F-test	***	**
LSD	3.49	3.39
SEM	4.58	2.91
Grand mean	70.83	80.00
P value	***	.

, ** and *** at P=.05, P=.01 and P=.001 level of significant respectively

Table 4. Interaction of essential oils and concentration on aphid mortality in fumigation assay

Essential oils	12hrs		24hrs	
	2µL	4 µL	2 µL	4 µL
Neem	66.6 ^{ef}	76.6 ^{cd}	73.33 ^d	76.66 ^d
Eucalyptus	73.3 ^{de}	90.0 ^{ab}	93.3 ^{abc}	96.6 ^{ab}
Palmarosa	83.33 ^{bc}	86.6 ^{ab}	86.66 ^c	93.3 ^{abc}
Citronella	83.33 ^{bc}	83.3 ^{bc}	96.66 ^{ab}	96.6 ^{ab}
Lemongrass	63.33 ^f	93.33 ^a	96.66 ^{ab}	100.0 ^a
Juniper berry	70.0 ^{def}	83.3 ^{bc}	73.33 ^d	93.3 ^{abc}
Mint	83.33 ^{bc}	86.6 ^{ab}	90.00 ^{bc}	100.0 ^a
Control	6.6 ^g	3.3 ^g	6.66 ^e	6.66 ^e
CV	8.39		7.21	
LSD	7.29		9.59	
Grand mean	70.83		7.21	

highest mortality of aphid was shown by lemongrass with 80%. Chalise & Dawadi [1] also reported that the highest contact mortality percentage had resulted in Lemongrass. Ricci et al. discovered that lemongrass oil could efficiently repel *Diuraphis noxia* (Mordvilko), a Russian wheat aphid. Zhang et al. [15] reported that with LC50 value of 169.6 mg/L in 24 hours after treatment, Lemongrass essential oil showed high toxicity against *Aphis citricola*. The various bioactive cyclic and acyclic terpene constituents

present in the oil of Lemongrass attributed to its insecticidal property [16]. The primary contributor for the insecticidal property of Lemongrass oil is citral which is a mixture of geranial and neral [16]. Citral can regulate cell proliferation by interacting with intracellular oxygen radicals and oxidative stress. Furthermore citral and other components may act on neuroreceptors, obstruct signal transduction, and induce hormonal imbalance, membrane damage, and cytotoxicity in the host [17]. In addition to its major

constituent, minor component such as germacrene D (2.24%), caryophyllene (0.57%) and caryophyllene oxide (0.58%) in limited quantity exhibit substantial insecticidal and repellent activities [18]. Lemongrass has the ability to block the function of several neurotransmitters, including acetylcholine esterase and octopamine [19,20].

Significance of the statement: Different plant essential oils can be used to meet the present needs of being pest specific, environmentally friendly, nonphytotoxic, nontoxic to mammals, less prone to insecticides resistance, relatively less expensive and locally available. Further, field experiments are recommended as this research only focus on management practice under laboratory conditions.

5. CONCLUSION

Aphis fabae, the black bean aphid (*Homoptera: Aphididae*) is the most devastating pest of the faba bean. Botanical insecticides including essential oils, with their new, highly bioactive constituents, have the potential to be highly effective pesticides as they are non-toxic to beneficial fauna, are biodegradable, environmentally friendly, human health-safe, and residue-free. The research revealed that Lemongrass with higher concentration had the highest mortality percentage while the lowest mortality percentage was shown by Neem with lower concentration after control in both contact and fumigation process. Therefore, with proper validation, Lemongrass can be used as an alternative to synthetic insecticides for the control of black bean aphid. However, further research in field condition is highly recommended to test the derived result which allows broader application at the farmer's level.

DISCLAIMER (ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE)

Author(s) hereby declare that NO generative AI technologies such as Large Language Models (ChatGPT, COPILOT, etc.) and text-to-image generators have been used during the writing or editing of this manuscript.

COMPETING INTERESTS

Authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

REFERENCES

1. Chalise PP, Dawadi S. Efficacy of plant essential oils on black bean aphid (*Aphis*

- fabae*) and cabbage aphid (*Brevicoryne brassicae*) under laboratory condition Storage insect pest management View project Traditional beekeeping with Apis cerana F. in Nepal View Project; 2019. Available:<http://www.entomoljournal.com>
2. Alghamdi AS. Insecticidal effect of four plant essential oils against two aphid species under laboratory conditions. *Journal of Applied Biology & Biotechnolog.* 2018;6(2):27–30. Available:<https://doi.org/10.7324/jabb.2018.60205>
3. Miles PW. Aphid saliva. *Biological Reviews.* 2019;74(1):41–85. Available:<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-185X.1999.tb00181.x>
4. Hansen LM, Lorentsen L, Boelt B. How to reduce the incidence of black bean aphids (*Aphis fabae* Scop.) attacking organic growing field beans (*Vicia faba* L.) by growing partially resistant bean varieties and by intercropping field beans with cereals. *Acta Agriculturae Scandinavica Section B: Soil and Plant Science.* 2008;58(4):359–364. Available:<https://doi.org/10.1080/09064710701788844>
5. Prüter C, Zebitz CPW. Effects of *Aphis fabae* and *Uromyces viciae-favae* on the growth of a susceptible and an aphid resistant cultivar of *Vicia faba*. *Annals of Applied Biology.* 1991;119(2), 215–226. Available:<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1744-7348.1991.tb04860.x>
6. Hurej BM, Werf WVANDER. The influence of black beaq aphid , *Aphis fabae* Scop ., and its Honeydew on the Photosynthesis of Sugar Beet. 1993;189–200.
7. Hogenhout SA, Ammar ED, Whitfield AE, Redinbaugh MG. Insect vector interactions with persistently transmitted viruses. *Annual Review of Phytopathology.* 2008;46:327–359. Available:<https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.phyto.022508.092135>
8. Casper R. Characterisation and Serology of Virus-Like Particles Associated with Faba Bean Necrotic Yellows. 1993;629–647.
9. Ebrahimi M, Safaralizade MH, Valizadegan O, Amin BHH. Efficacy of three plant essential oils, *Azadirachta indica* (Adr. Juss.), *Eucalyptus camaldulensis* (Dehn.) and *Laurus nobilis* (L.) on mortality cotton aphids, *Aphis gossypii* Glover (Hem: Aphididae). *Archives of Phytopathology*

- and Plant Protection. 2013;46(9):1093–1101.
Available:<https://doi.org/10.1080/03235408.2012.758347>
10. Vinelina Yankova, Dima Markova, Georgi Velichkov NV. Plant oils for control of cotton aphid (*Aphis gossypii* Glov.) in Greenhouse Cucumbers. *Türk Tarım ve Doğa Bilimleri Dergisi*. 2014;1565–1568.
 11. Bakkali F, Averbeck S, Averbeck D, Idaomar M. Biological effects of essential oils - A review. *Food and Chemical Toxicology*. 2008;46(2):446–475.
Available:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fct.2007.09.106>
 12. Isman MB Plant essential oils for pest and disease management. *Crop Protection*. 2000;19(8–10):603–608.
Available:[https://doi.org/10.1016/S0261-2194\(00\)00079-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0261-2194(00)00079-X)
 13. Tomova BS, Waterhouse JS, Doberski J. The effect of fractionated Tagetes oil volatiles on aphid reproduction. *Entomologia Experimentalis et Applicata*. 2015;115(1):153–159.
Available:<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1570-7458.2005.00291.x>
 14. Shahid Nisar M, Rashid A, Samiullah K, Haidar MR, Malik S. Ecofriendly Approaches for Controlling Mustard Aphid (*Lipaphis Erysimi* Kalt.) Infestation. *Plant Protection*. 2023;7(1):1–7.
Available:<https://doi.org/10.33804/pp.007.01.4455>
 15. Zhang C, Liu R, He J, Ma Z, Zhang X. Chemical compositions of ligusticum chuanxiong oil and lemongrass oil and their joint action against aphid citricola van der goot (Hemiptera: Aphididae). *Molecules*. 2016;21(10).
Available:<https://doi.org/10.3390/molecules21101359>
 16. Eden WT, Alighiri D, Supardi KI, Cahyono E. The Mosquito Repellent Activity of the Active Component of Air Freshener Gel from Java Citronella Oil (*Cymbopogon winterianus*); 2020.
 17. Feroz A. Efficiency and cytotoxic potential of deltamethrin, essential oils of *Cymbopogon citratus* and *Cinnamomum camphora* and their synergistic combinations against stored product pest, *Trogoderma granarium*. *Journal of Stored Products Research*. 2020;87:101614.
Available:<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jspr.2020.101614>
 18. Talbi M, Hajji L, Brouzi AEI, & Mohammedia T. Chemical composition and insecticidal activity of *Anacyclus pyrethrum* essential oil from the Bensliman area against *Culex pipiens*. 2017;10(1):13–21.
 19. Singh KD, Labala RK, Devi TB, Singh NI, Chanu HD, Sougrakpam S, Nameirakpam BS, Sahoo, D. Biochemical efficacy, molecular docking and inhibitory effect of 2, 3-dimethylmaleic anhydride on insect acetylcholinesterase. *Scientific Reports*. 2017;1–11.
Available:<https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-017-12932-0>
 20. Ricci M, Padín S, Ringuélet J, Kahan A. Use of lemongrass (*Cymbopogon citratus* Stapf) essential oil as a repellent of *Diuraphis noxia* Kurdj. (Hemiptera: Aphididae) in wheat. *Agricultura técnica*. 2006;66(3):256-263.

Disclaimer/Publisher's Note: The statements, opinions and data contained in all publications are solely those of the individual author(s) and contributor(s) and not of the publisher and/or the editor(s). This publisher and/or the editor(s) disclaim responsibility for any injury to people or property resulting from any ideas, methods, instructions or products referred to in the content.

© Copyright (2024): Author(s). The licensee is the journal publisher. This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0>), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Peer-review history:

The peer review history for this paper can be accessed here:

<https://www.sdiarticle5.com/review-history/124954>